



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

AGENDA

Committee POLICY REVIEW AND PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

Date and Time of Meeting TUESDAY, 18 MAY 2021, 5.00 PM

Venue REMOTE VIA MS TEAMS

Membership Councillor Walker (Chair)
Councillors Ahmed, Berman, Bowen-Thomson, Cowan, Henshaw, Lister and Mackie

Time approx.

1 Apologies for Absence

To receive apologies for absence.

2 Declarations of Interest

To be made at the start of the agenda item in question, in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

3 Minutes (Pages 5 - 20)

To approve as a correct record the minutes of the previous meetings.

4 Capital Ambition: Organisational Recovery and Renewal - to follow 5.00 pm

Pre-decision scrutiny of the Cabinet report outlining how the Council will seek to adapt to the challenges and opportunities of the new operating environment as the city emerges from the current phase of the pandemic.

5 Committee Business (Pages 21 - 58) 6.30 pm

6 Urgent Items (if any)

7 Way Forward

8 **Date of next meeting - 9 June 2021**

Davina Fiore

Director Governance & Legal Services

Date: Wednesday, 12 May 2021

Contact: Kate Rees, 029 2087 2427, kate.rees@cardiff.gov.uk

WEBCASTING

This meeting will be filmed for live and/or subsequent broadcast on the Council's website. The whole of the meeting will be filmed, except where there are confidential or exempt items, and the footage will be on the website for 6 months. A copy of it will also be retained in accordance with the Council's data retention policy.

Members of the public may also film or record this meeting.

If you make a representation to the meeting you will be deemed to have consented to being filmed. By entering the body of the Chamber you are also consenting to being filmed and to the possible use of those images and sound recordings for webcasting and/or training purposes. If you do not wish to have your image captured you should sit in the public gallery area.

If you have any queries regarding webcasting of meetings, please contact Committee Services on 02920 872020 or email [Democratic Services](#)

This page is intentionally left blank

POLICY REVIEW AND PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

20 JANUARY 2021

Present: Councillor Walker(Chairperson)
Councillors Ahmed, Berman, Bowen-Thomson, Cowan,
Henshaw, Lister and Mackie

1 : APPOINTMENT OF CHAIRPERSON AND MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEE

Noted.

2 : TERMS OF REFERENCE

Noted.

3 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Councillor Cowan advised the Chair that she may need to leave the meeting early.

4 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None received.

5 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 10 November 2020 were agreed as a correct record.

6 : RACE EQUALITY TASK FORCE

The Chairperson welcomed Cllr Huw Thomas, Leader of Cardiff Council, Cllr Saeed Ebrahim, Chair of the Race Equality Taskforce, Gareth Newell, Head of Performance & Partnerships; and Sian Sanders, OM Community Cohesion & Equalities to the meeting.

The Chairperson reminded Members that in July 2020 the Covid-19 Scrutiny Panel undertook pre-decision scrutiny of the Leader's proposal to establish a Race Equality Taskforce for Cardiff. Following the scrutiny, commenting on governance of the Taskforce going forward, the Panel wrote to the Leader recommending that the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee be afforded an insight into the Taskforce's activities and requested that representatives attend Committee once Terms of Reference and plans were in place. The Leader welcomed the Committee's insight and suggested an update would be valuable once the Taskforce had set the direction for what it wanted to achieve. This was Committee's first progress update.

The Chairperson had also invited Councillor Ramesh Patel as a Scrutiny Chair and Member of the Covid-19 Scrutiny Panel with a particular interest in this area.

The Chairperson invited the Leader to make a statement in which he thanked Cllr Ebrahim and all the people who had put their names forward and those who have

been selected for the Task Force. He considered there was a strong blend of people on board. The Leader also thanked Sian Sanders and her team who have made a lot of progress since the establishment of the Task Force, and in the middle of a pandemic. It was early days and it would be possible to secure some quick wins and also put in place some longer term changes.

The Chairperson invited Cllr Ebrahim to make a statement in which he said that he was delighted to have been selected as the Chair of the Race Equality Task Force and he has been heartened to see so many colleagues and partners eager to be involved in this work and see it achieve its potential in the months ahead.

As Chair, he stated his commitment to ensuring the Taskforce refocuses efforts on race equality as a city and drives forwards much needed change. The challenge of inequality is by no means unique to Cardiff, but there is much we can do as a city to widen opportunity and inclusion for Black and Minority Ethnic Cardiff citizens.

The Taskforce is be charged with doing just that- scoping the possible, making the right changes happen, and treating these issues with the urgency and profile that they deserve.

Officers from the Policy and Partnerships Department, provided an update on work completed so far and what the Taskforce aims to deliver during the course of the current administration.

Members received a presentation after which the Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members asked if there were representatives from businesses on the taskforce and were advised that there was a cross representation of people from local entrepreneurs to solicitors, and there were also discussions taking place with the Chamber of Commerce and the Tech industry, among others.

Members discussed Educational representation and were pleased to see a Head Teacher on the taskforce. Members were advised that a pupil from Fitzalan and a lecturer from the Open University also sat on the taskforce; the Educational working group would be chaired by education colleagues/schools. When asked if there was enough education data available officers considered there was.

Members discussed the importance of having representation from the youth justice service including BAME reps. It was noted that this will be a strong focal point; there are also people on the taskforce with experience of the Criminal Justice System.

Members asked about diversity and the Cabinet Member explained that when selecting representatives from the candidates, many things including diversity, ethnicity and background were taken into consideration. The Cabinet Member was happy the taskforce was diverse.

Members further discussed diversity across senior management in the Council and the importance of introducing career progression programmes, mentoring, apprenticeships etc. The Leader stated it was important to understand perceived barriers; he was pleased to see how well represented people of colour are in the

apprenticeships coming through currently; he considered it important to look at Cardiff Commitment to ensure it is representative.

Members asked if the task force was ongoing or time limited, and whether there would be different reports on different aspects at different times. Members were advised that the task force was sitting for the term of this administration, in relation to reporting there would be regular updates through relevant boards/Cabinet as soon as is practicable. The Leader added that the recommendations from the task force would only be effective if there is political support and he hoped this would continue after May 2022.

Members asked if the Covid impact on BAME people would be included in the Health and Social Care work stream and were advised that it would, alongside other health considerations.

Members noted the figures relating to the low number of Bangladeshi women employed and asked if this would be a focus. The Cabinet Member stated it would be, there would be a working group on labour market issues.

Members referred to the data on education performance of BAME groups and asked what could be learned from this data. Members and officers noted that BAME groups often have excellent educational attainment but it was important to look at the bridge between education and good quality jobs, looking at personal skills and mentoring not just exam results. A discussion took place around people's networks, well educated people falling into circles and the importance of analysing why this happens.

AGREED: that the Chairperson, on behalf of the Committee, writes to the Cabinet Member conveying the observations of the Committee when discussing the way forward.

7 : BUDGET CONSULTATION 2021/22

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Chris Weaver, Cabinet Member Finance Modernisation & Performance; Chris Lee, Director of Resources; Gareth Newell, Head of Performance & Partnerships; and Sian Sanders, OM Community Cohesion & Equalities to the meeting.

The Chairperson reminded Members that the Council's Budget Consultation for 2021/22 is now live having been agreed at a special Cabinet on 13th January. It runs until 10th February 2021. Therefore Committee's task, having had a briefing on the approach this year, was to contribute to the consultation and feed any concerns and observations to the Cabinet to inform Cabinet discussion and debate in preparing their final 2021/22 budget proposals.

The Chairperson invited Cllr Weaver to make a statement in which he said that Cardiff had received a slightly better settlement from Welsh Government which has resulted in a slightly reduced budget gap. He considered it was important to reflect that there had been a truncated process due to the General Election last year and it had been hoped that regular timescales would be resumed this year. This had not

happened this year however. It is appropriate that people adapt to the situation we are working in this year.

Members received a presentation after which the Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members asked how the previous years' consultation had influenced this year's budget. The Cabinet Member explained that they look at the priorities outlined, these inform decisions on the allocation of the FRM etc. and begin to anticipate what the public want and build this into the future budget and shape decisions.

Members discussed consultation with young people, whether there was an easy accessible child friendly format of the consultation and whether there was engagement with schools and the youth justice service. Officers explained that there was not currently a separate version but they would continue to approach schools and other stakeholders to gain access to young people, noting it was difficult to reach young people and get responses. Members considered that previous successful surveys could be looked at, the best bits teased out and sense checked to support further engagement with young people going forward.

Members discussed the pay award assumptions and the Cabinet Member explained that the UK Government had given an indication but no certainty so assumptions have to be made; it will be moderately prudent so if it changes it can be dealt with without pressures on services.

In relation to consultation, Members asked if lessons had been learned on how to increase the response rate using social media. The Cabinet Member stated it was difficult to predict the impact of a non-face to face engagement on response rates. They know paper doesn't work, the click rates on adverts would need to be reviewed, and it was important to continually monitor to ensure they are talking to the right audience. It was noted that the adverts need to entice people to take part and that numbers of responses were important but the responses were more important.

Members referred to the Grant Income referenced in paragraph 18 of the report, noting it was a substantial amount and asked if it was expected. Officers explained it refers mainly to the Social Care Grant, they had not yet seen the LA allocation and would not see this until the settlement is received. It was important to not underestimate the Covid risk too; there would be a full assessment on recovery. The Cabinet Member stated that there are movements in grants every year, sometimes significant but the important part is seeing the full detail for Cardiff.

Members noted the consultation ends one and half weeks before the scrutiny of budget proposals and asked if this was enough time to feed back the results. The Cabinet Member noted it was a tight timescale and he would have preferred the provisional settlement in the early autumn as it leaves more time for everyone. Digital results will speed things up. Members requested to see the consultation document before it is published next year.

AGREED: that the Chairperson, on behalf of the Committee, writes to the Cabinet Member conveying the observations of the Committee when discussing the way forward.

8 : CABINET RESPONSE TO THE COMMITTEES REPORT ENTITLED SCRUTINY IMPACT ASSESSMENT MODEL

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Chris Weaver, Cabinet Member Finance Modernisation & Performance; Gary Jones, Head of Democratic Services and Dylan Owen, Head of Cabinet Office to the meeting.

The Chairperson reminded Members that last year Committee completed its inquiry to develop a model to capture the benefits of scrutiny activity as an established function of the Council's decision making process. The Committee made seven recommendations to the Cabinet and in December the Cabinet agreed its response to the Scrutiny Impact Assessment Inquiry. Committee will now hear how the organisation is progressing those recommendations that have been accepted.

The Chairperson invited Cllr Weaver to make a statement in which he said that Cabinet had welcomed the recommendations and could see how they would enhance the clarity of scrutiny and feed into performance reporting. He noted that 6/7 recommendations had been accepted and the seventh recommendation had been partially accepted and an exact process for tracking has now been developed.

The Chairperson invited Dylan Owen to address Committee. Members were advised that there was now a system to formally track and record all recommendations made; which are accepted, partially accepted or rejected. When recommendations have been accepted there is a clear pathway with SMART objectives and Cabinet and Scrutiny will be updated twice yearly on progress so there is full oversight. Information used by Scrutiny colleagues to inform the impact of Scrutiny work would also be reported twice yearly at half and year end performance stages.

The Chairperson invited Gary Jones to address Committee. Members were advised that the report had been co-produced with Scrutiny, Cabinet Office and Senior Management Team. Scrutiny now self-assess and review their processes, recommendations and outcomes and these will be reported into a new style Annual report.

The Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members discussed the importance of the letter to Cabinet Members setting out clearly whether recommendations are made. It was also noted that for it to work properly, clarity was needed on what a recommendation is and that Cabinet provide explicit responses on whether they accept/partially accept or reject the recommendations.

Members asked how it would help self-assessment and were advised that it would be used as part of the improvement process with a lead officer assigned to take it forward; objectives need to be SMART and have a timescale. This would be brought in line with mid/end year assessments and give a performance picture for the Council. To ensure it adds value it would be used in the forward programmes.

Members noted the amount of work undertaken and asked if it could be offered to other council's as a model. Officers advised that the Head of Democratic Services as

chair of the South East Wales scrutiny officers network, has made them aware of the model, after the pilot he would feedback as to how they can adapt it, if it works well it can go the Centre for Governance for Scrutiny for the whole of the UK.

AGREED: that the Chairperson, on behalf of the Committee, writes to the Cabinet Member conveying the observations of the Committee when discussing the way forward.

9 : URGENT ITEMS (IF ANY)

Bus Emergency Scheme 2

The Chairperson advised Members that this item was unavailable prior to publication of the Committee agenda but its consideration by scrutiny is deemed urgent as it requires pre-decision scrutiny prior to Cabinet meeting tomorrow.

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Caro Wild, Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; Jason Dixon, Operational Manager, Transport, Development & Network Management; and John Gibson, Principal Engineer, Public Transport to the meeting

The Chairperson reminded Members they are scrutinising the proposed Bus Emergency Scheme 2 arrangements that formalise Welsh Government's commitment to support the recovery of bus services following the impact of Covid-19.

The Chairperson invited Cllr Wild to make a statement in which he said that he was grateful for the urgent consideration by scrutiny. He stated that since the start of the pandemic there had been work to ensure that bus services were available despite a reduction in services. The previous Bus Emergency Scheme 1 expires in March so the next phase was needed to seek to establish a longer term agreement with Welsh Government to enable better management of the recovery of services.

Members received a verbal update after which the Chairperson invited questions and comments from Members.

Members asked if this covered private buses too and were advised that it did.

Members asked if there had previously been monies from the WG hardship fund. Officers advised that there had been from April 2020, all administered by Welsh Government directly but as this was procurement it takes a different route.

Members discussed the how the future of bus companies could look with Transport for Wales; increasing the use of public transport, the quality of public transport and improved routes were needed.

Members asked if the group would have any say in vehicles, renewing, carbon neutral etc. Officers explained that the quality of vehicles, air quality, noise etc. are all considerations.

AGREED: that the Chairperson, on behalf of the Committee, writes to the Cabinet Member conveying the observations of the Committee when discussing the way forward.

10 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING - 10.00AM 24 FEBRUARY 2021

The meeting terminated at 6.49 pm

This page is intentionally left blank

POLICY REVIEW AND PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

24 FEBRUARY 2021

Present: Councillor Walker(Chairperson)
Councillors Ahmed, Berman, Cowan, Henshaw, Lister and Mackie

11 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

None received.

12 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Cllr Berman declared a personal interest as his husband is involved in supplying 4g to schools.

Cllr Henshaw declared a personal interest as her daughter was in receipt of a business support grant.

Cllr Mackie declared a personal interest as she is employed by the Cardiff & Vale Health Board for the Vaccination programme.

13 : CORPORATE PLAN 2021-24

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Huw Thomas, Leader of the Council; Councillor Chris Weaver, Cabinet Member Finance, Modernisation and Performance; Paul Orders, Chief Executive; Sarah McGill, Corporate Director People & Communities; Chris Lee, Corporate Director, Resources; Gareth Newell, Head of Policy & Partnerships; and Dylan Owen, Head of the Cabinet Office to the meeting.

The Chairperson advised Committee that this was an opportunity for them to undertake pre-decision scrutiny of the final draft Corporate Plan 2021-24. The Leader had engaged informally with the Committee's Performance Panel and chairs of all scrutiny committees last week, focussing on the target setting process for the Corporate Plan. Following the discussion the comments, observations and concerns of scrutiny (attached at Appendix 2) were relayed to the Leader, prior to publication of this final draft of the plan.

The Chairperson invited the Leader to make a statement in which he said that the Corporate Plan was developed during a time of challenge and uncertainty; the focus had been on the pandemic response, nevertheless the Plan was robust and rigorous; the performance panel have been involved and recommendations from them included in the Plan. There was a focus on Child Friendly Recovery, respecting and understanding the unequal impacts of the pandemic on everyone including older people.

The Chairperson invited Officers to give an oversight presentation of the Plan and any changes that have been made as a result of scrutiny engagement so far, after which he invited questions and comments from Members;

Members asked what initiatives the Council have developed to help children catch up and help schools deal with pupils who have fallen behind. Members noted that schools have different approaches to this and there was an opportunity for consistency from the local authority. Members also referred to the long term mental health impacts and how these would be addressed in partnership with Health and Education. The Leader drew Members attention to paragraphs 1.2-1.4 noting the importance of opening schools safely, producing a school recovery plan by May 2021 and delivering a quality approach to blended learning to mitigate a future lockdown. With regard to mental health, the Leader drew Members attention to paragraph 1.5 relating to Health and Wellbeing of the workforce and paragraph 1.6 relating to support for young people. He added there was a comprehensive suite of measures to address these real concerns. Officers added that the Corporate Plan addressed these concerns in two clear sections; re-engagement of pupils and safety; they would continue to deliver on Cardiff 2030 priorities. Schools had recently opened for foundation phase and key workers and there had been positive feedback regarding schools being Covid safe. A number of issues would be ongoing such as engagement with Head Teachers on challenges of schools reopening; multi-agency approach to the mental health challenge, collectively supporting schools; ensuring all pupils have digital devices; embracing the improved relationship with parents especially in more challenging communities and involvement in the Welsh Government accelerated learning programme targeting catch up strategies for those who need it. The Leader added that the Estyn report had been very strong in relation to Cardiff's approach to distance learning.

Members asked if there was any evidence to support the work regarding engagement in challenging areas such as the Southern Arc of the City. Officers stated there was, the consortium regularly liaises with school leaders as well as the Council on engagement with pupils; this had been positive in some areas although there were still some challenges to address in some deprived communities. Members stated they would like to see the data on this.

Members were aware of the number of cases relating to the Youth Offending Service waiting to go through the court system, which would need extra resources and asked what resources were available to support children above school age or out of school. The Leader explained there had been financial adjustments in the proposed budget to address the extra resource requirements in the Youth Service, +16, +18, as well as Education and Youth Offending Service. There would be a continued rollout of the Youth Offending Service Strategy. The Chief Executive added that there would be continued emphasis on mentoring support for Youth Services, Youth Justice Service and Childrens Services and also working with Youth Justice Service on employment opportunities where there was positive work coming from Cardiff Commitment. He stated he would like more specific employment schemes developed in partnership with the Cardiff Commitment and was developing discussions with other employers.

Members asked about support for parents and how many digital devices were needed for pupils, further asking if the devices would stay in the school for future use, post-Covid. Officers explained that they have already distributed over 20,000 devices and many more were ready to go; the aim was for 1:1 per pupil above foundation phase and they keep the devices to use in school and at home. For foundation phase the aim was 1:2, and to ensure that there was 1 device in the household, if there are multiple siblings they can ask for more. The Leader stressed

that devices are not a panacea as even though some pupils have them they are still not engaging due to other circumstances. Looking forward it was the expectation that devices would remain with the school to encourage digital inclusion and to support the digital curriculum; there would be a question in 3/5 years when the devices need to be renewed. In terms of support for parents, the Leader referred Members to the report and the reshaping of respite provision and overnight respite particularly for parents of pupils with learning difficulties; this was a key theme and a commitment in the budget.

Members referred to the regeneration of the City Centre and Cardiff Bay and asked if there will be a focus on local/district shopping centres across the City, asking if the 20 minute neighbourhood approach had been considered. The Leader stated that he was a big believer in the approach, noting the discussion he had had with Sustrans regarding segregated cycle ways; density and sufficient population was needed to support schools, shops, leisure centres etc.; the need to consider this approach in the round in the LDP; and as people continue to work from home, local areas will be used more and there would be less influx of people to the City Centre.

Members referred to supporting people out of poverty and asked if there was enough emphasis on employment opportunities and raising standards in schools particularly in deprived areas. The Leader stated he agreed with the concept that a good education was the basis for a good job; he noted the improvements in educational attainment in the City and especially in the Southern Arc, during the last decade, noting the NEET figs had decreased from 20% to 1.5%. He added that there is a lot in the Corporate Plan that demonstrates the grip on this agenda and also on improving links with employment opportunities. The strategic direction was the Education 2030 Strategy and also rebuilding schools in the Southern Arc of the City.

Members discussed digital consultations and the importance of identifying people who are not digitally included and consulting with them in other ways; it was considered this could be reflected in the Citizen Engagement Strategy which will be prepared in the next 12 months.

Members discussed the importance of all staff and Councillors becoming Dementia Friends by March 2022 and urged any Councillors who have not completed the training to do so.

Members referred to section 7.1, 'Developing a comprehensive programme of organisational recovery and renewal to adapt Council services for the post-pandemic world', noting there was just one KPI relating to this. The Chief Executive accepted that it was a major piece of organisational development work needed by the Council, looking at office accommodation, agile working and those areas that have been badly affected by the last 12 months. There would be a Cabinet proposal in May with more detail.

Members asked about the link between the Corporate Plan and the Budget, noting the lack of financial KPI's, savings, budgets, and staff resources in the Corporate Plan. Members considered aligning the two would be beneficial. The Chief Executive stated it would link to the Medium Term Financial Plan and there was work in advance of the budget setting process for 2022/23, which was a key piece of work.

He considered that the Plan compliments the budget and did not think it needed specific financial targets.

RESOLVED: The Committee AGREED that the Chairperson writes to the Cabinet Members on behalf of the Committee to convey their comments and observations.

14 : DRAFT BUDGET PROPOSALS 2021-22

The Chairperson advised Committee Members that in line with this Committee's Terms of Reference Members have responsibility for taking an overview of revenue and capital budget proposals from a corporate and strategic point of view. In addition they would receive a brief overview of budget implications for specific services that fall within the Resource Director's remit.

This budget item would be split into two parts: An overview of the 2021/22 corporate wide budget proposals which would include a summary of the implications for the Resources directorate and Governance and Legal Services, followed by Scrutiny of the Capital Programme,

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Chris Weaver, Cabinet Member Finance, Modernisation and Performance; Chris Lee, Corporate Director Resources; Sarah McGill, Corporate Director, People & Communities; Ian Allwood, Head of Finance; Gareth Newell, Partnership and Community Engagement Manager and Sian Sanders, Cohesion & Community Engagement Manager to the meeting.

The Chairperson invited Cllr Weaver to make a statement on the 2021/22 budget. Councillor Weaver referred to the provisional settlement received just before Christmas which means a shorter budget process. As the settlement was better than anticipated the level of savings is slightly lower, as is the Council Tax increase.

The Chairperson invited Finance officers to give a corporate overview of the budget and briefly outline the implications for Resources services (Finance, HR, Digital), after which he invited questions and comments from Members;

Members noted the Red/Amber RAG rating against accountancy staff resources and asked if this posed a risk to the Council and if officers were confident that the savings were achievable. Officers explained that the savings were achievable as there is a vacant post; there are challenges in terms of getting the right skills mix to address the financial challenges; training is ongoing and there are three trainees who will hopefully qualify by the summer; the risk is getting the right people into posts and this is being mitigated by training staff internally. It was noted that if the specific skills needed to be brought in then the money would have to be spent.

Members asked about pay rises for staff and were advised that there was an estimate of 2% for Council staff, although it was not yet an agreed figure.

Members asked how Cardiff compares on Council Tax increase with other Local Authorities and were advised that some in Wales were around 4%, some in England were 5% and Cardiff was 3.5%.

Members asked about Council Tax collections and were advised that collection rates are regularly monitored, more so this year, and they are within 1% of where they would normally be, other Local Authorities (LA's) were worse. Bad debt provisions would be looked at when needed.

Members discussed the Financial Resilience Model (FRM) and contingency reserves, and considered that the reserves looked slim compared to other LA's. The Cabinet Member considered the FRM was important to ensure financial resilience outside of the reserves; it can be used if a lower settlement is received and if not needed it can be used to address targeted interventions such as recycling rates, supporting young people after the pandemic etc. Officers added that reserves are only part of the picture, they are part of a suite of indicators and the Section 151 Officer assured Members he considered them to be robust. Members noted the reserves were £4.8 million earmarked reserves.

Members discussed Covid implications into next year, loss of incomes etc. and it was noted that further support from Government would be needed.

Members discussed the pressures and overspends in Adult and Children's Social Services. Officers explained that work was underway with Welsh Government to identify any costs that are from the pandemic and understand the issues; month 9 showed a significant improvement in Adult Social Services. Officers are aware of the challenges and plans are in place to work very closely to address them.

Members referred to the recommendation from this Committee in September 2020 that savings be specific to each area and not across the board, asking if this had been done. Officers outlined the approach taken with each area's savings proposals being subject to a robust business case and linking specific budget proposals to the Corporate Plan; it was recognised that not all areas can give the same and that more was being done at the planning stage to ensure robustness and achievability.

Members sought clarity on the FRM amount for supporting certain bus routes and were advised that this was a carry forward.

Members asked how achievable income generation would be this year in the current climate. It was noted that income reliant on the public was unlikely to be achieved but income such as fees and charges was more reliable.

Members asked what percentage of Covid related costs would be claimed back from Welsh Government (WG) and were advised that currently over 95% of claims had been received back to date. Members asked if the Council had topped up the extra 20% to furloughed staff and were advised they did and that no-ones salary had been reduced.

In relation to homelessness, Members asked if the budget future proofs the work that is ongoing. Officers explained that the WG hardship fund has supported homelessness to date and WG has been clear about what is available for next year. Officers have reviewed the budgets and with both monies, they are confident they can maintain it but it will be a challenge. Key issues are having capital investment monies, chargeable rents, appropriate service charges and to prepare for the future.

Members noted the complexity in separating out the extra Covid costs and routine work costs but asked if there was any way this could be refined in the coming year to make it clearer. Officers explained that the month 9 report to Cabinet, separates out the Covid costs that have been claimed from WG; this was starting point and it would be reviewed going forward.

Members asked if Track Trace Protect was going as planned. Officers explained they had increased resources in recent months, figures are submitted to the Heath Board monthly and resources are adjusted as needed; the TTP team are also supporting National work. The team will be required for some time yet, even after the vaccination programme.

RESOLVED: The Committee AGREED that the Chairperson writes to the Cabinet Members on behalf of the Committee to convey their comments and observations.

15 : DRAFT CAPITAL PROGRAMME 2021/22 - 2025/26

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Chris Weaver, Cabinet Member Finance, Modernisation and Performance; Chris Lee, Corporate Director Resources; Sarah McGill, Corporate Director, People & Communities; Ian Allwood, Head of Finance and Anil Hirani, Operational Manager, Capital, Corporate & Treasury for this item.

The Chairperson invited Cllr Weaver to make a statement on the Capital budget & programme in which he outlined a number of large items including a large part of the Capital Programme spend over the last few years on Schools and Council Housing; and new and amended schemes such as neighbourhood and district centre regeneration.

The Chairperson invited Finance Officers to give their presentation, after which he invited questions and comments from Members;

Members noted that in the five year plan the figures in 2022/23 were very high. Officers explained that in the Capital Strategy there is a deliverability angle whereby expenditure tends to fall in the middle of the five year cycle, there could of course always be slippages. Also Welsh Government Grants were allocated on an annual basis which makes longer term planning more difficult; only the grants that are known about are included. Any supposition on larger schemes were included in the report.

Members discussed local centre regeneration and the budget for this, asking if it was just for infrastructure and noted that it does not include grant support. Officers advised this was correct, it needs to be capital in nature. Members asked if what was in the budget sufficiently joined up with the Corporate Plan and were advised that it links to wider economic regeneration and not everything the Council will do goes into the Corporate Plan.

Members sought clarity on the Roath Park Dam and were advised that discussion between Natural Resources Wales and the Council had taken place and work was essential, so it needed to be included in the programme but at this stage the detail of the work required was unclear.

Members noted the impressive amount of Capital Schemes and asked if they were RAG rated as to their achievability and risk to the Council. Officers explained that risks happen at all stages of the Capital Programme; a desktop appraisal is

undertaken at the start of the project, and slippage is shown in monitoring reports; it can be quite complex as some money doesn't get spent quickly enough, so risk assessment happens throughout the projects life.

Members asked if there were any red risks and Officers advised this would relate to slippages/affordability/interest rates/progress on works etc. It would be on a project by project basis, there has to be a robust business case and treasury management is critical in monitoring borrowing over time, tracking borrowing, looking at revenue spend etc. All indicators are challenged and Audit are included throughout.

Members asked if borrowing was at a fixed rate. Officers explained that they don't borrow on a project by project basis but by the whole Capital Programme, so there is a mix of borrowing types to provide flexibility.

RESOLVED: The Committee AGREED that the Chairperson writes to the Cabinet Members on behalf of the Committee to convey their comments and observations.

16 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING - 16 MARCH 2021

The meeting terminated at 12.42 pm

This page is intentionally left blank

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

**POLICY REVIEW & PERFORMANCE
SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

18 May 2021

Committee Business Report

Reason for this Report

1. To bring to the Committee's attention three business matters:
 - a. A briefing on '*Capturing and Reporting the Impact of Scrutiny*';
 - b. An update on correspondence arising from recent scrutiny meetings;
 - c. Advise on the Forward Work Programme for June and July 2021.

Capturing and Reporting the Impact of Scrutiny

2. Attached at **Appendix 1** is a briefing note on '*Capturing and Reporting the Impact of Scrutiny*'. The briefing note sets out that, following the work of this Committee's task group on capturing scrutiny impact, the model developed is now being implemented for capturing the impact of the work of the five scrutiny committees. Data and evidence of scrutiny activity throughout the year will be collected, supporting the Council in complying with the self-assessment requirements of the new Local Government & Elections (Wales) Act 2021.
3. The briefing also sets out plans for a single Scrutiny Annual Report for 2020/21, which will be considered by this Scrutiny Committee in June 2021.

Correspondence

4. Following each Scrutiny Committee meeting, the Chair writes on behalf of all Members, to the relevant Cabinet Member and senior officer, summing up

the Committee's comments, concerns and recommendations regarding the issues considered during that meeting. The Committee is routinely copied in to the letters when they are forwarded to the Cabinet Member. Depending on the issues highlighted, the letter usually asks for a response from the Cabinet Member to any recommendations made, and sometimes requests further information.

5. For Members information attached to this report at **Appendices 2, 3, 4 & 5** are copies of correspondence following the January and February meetings of the committee, both letters sent and Cabinet responses where received.
6. Where responses are *outstanding* the support officer continues to follow up on the Committee's behalf, particularly where the Committee has made a formal recommendation for monitoring as part of the new model and database in place to capture the impact of scrutiny. There are occasions, however, that the Committee does not formally request a response.

Committee	Scrutiny	Appendix
20 Jan 2021	Bus Emergency Scheme 2	2a
20 Jan 2021	Cabinet Response - Bus Emergency Scheme 2	2b
20 Jan 2021	Budget Consultation	3a
20 Jan 2021	Cabinet Response – Budget Consultation	<i>outstanding</i>
20 Jan 2021	Race Equality Taskforce	4a
20 Jan 2021	Cabinet Response - Race Equality Taskforce	4b
24 Feb 2021	Corporate Plan 2021/24 & Budget 2021/22	5
24 Feb 2021	Cabinet Response - Corporate Plan 2021/24 Budget 2021/22	5b

PRAP Forward Work Programme – June/July 2021

7. As part of the Council's response to the Wales Audit Office report '*Overview and Scrutiny - Fit for the Future?*' (July 2018), the Committee's Forward

Work Programme (FWP) is published quarterly on the Council's internet site.

8. The next published FWP will set out topics available for scrutiny for June and July 2021. Details of potential Cabinet Agenda Items further ahead than this have yet to be agreed. Members are invited to note the FWP at **Appendix 6**, raise any issues or concerns at the meeting, and agree publication on the Council's website.

Legal Implications

9. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

10. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under

review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee is recommended to:

- a. reflect on the *'Capturing and Reporting the Impact of Scrutiny'* Briefing;
- b. note correspondence between the Committee and the Cabinet; and
- c. consider the proposed Forward Work Programme and approve for publication on the Council's website.

Davina Fiore

Director Governance & Legal

12 May 2021

Capturing and Reporting the Impact of Scrutiny

Purpose

1. To advise Members of all Scrutiny Committees of the introduction of improved scrutiny processes and ensure unified cross committee understanding and approach.

Background

2. Scrutiny members recognise that the scrutiny function enriches the decision-making of the organisation. Whilst such understanding derives from engagement and contribution to scrutiny, the value and visibility of the function within the organisation would benefit from further embedding.
3. A task and finish inquiry of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee recently addressed the absence of a mechanism for capturing the impact of the work of all five scrutiny committees, and the value of the scrutiny function to the organisation resulting from the implementation of scrutiny recommendations.
4. A practical model has been developed that will collect data and evidence of scrutiny activity throughout the year and link with the Council's performance framework.
5. The model supports the Council in complying with the self-assessment requirements of the new Local Government & Elections (Wales) Bill by introducing service area self-assessment of the implementation of accepted scrutiny recommendations.

Capturing and recording scrutiny recommendations

6. Continual development of Scrutiny is a key objective for the Chairs of Scrutiny. Currently in pilot stage, the new model provides a framework and database on which a quantitative assessment of scrutiny's impact on council services can be captured and reported to Council annually.
7. Importantly, the model extends the governance arrangements currently in place for responding to the recommendations of a scrutiny inquiry, to those generated by scrutiny committees in correspondence.
8. If a committee agrees that a recommendation(s) has emerged out of the scrutiny of a topic then it will be captured by the scrutiny officer and stated clearly in the body of the Chairs letter to the Cabinet, and for the avoidance of doubt in bold at the end of the letter. All recommendations will then form part of formal impact monitoring during the year.
9. Currently a committee can expect a formal Cabinet response to recommendations following task group inquiries. This response is in the form of '*accept*', '*partially accept*' or '*not accepted*'.

In future the Cabinet will also formally respond to recommendations set out in correspondence following scrutiny committees as requiring monitoring.

10. Members are requested to be very clear in making their recommendations for capture by scrutiny officers during discussion at the Way Forward following a scrutiny committee. Wherever possible recommendations should be '**SMART**' (specific, measurable, achievable, realistic and timely). Whilst recommendations may not routinely emerge from monthly meetings, any ambiguity over whether a recommendation will be monitored as part of the scrutiny and performance impact assessment database must be avoided.
11. The model will capture quantitative impact by introducing the concept of '*substantiveness*' as a key measure in determining the level of influence or *impact* that recommendations have on corporate policy.
12. If a recommendation is '*not accepted*' then it will not be reflected in the service area action plan and cannot therefore be included in the impact assessment. Only *accepted* and *partially accepted* recommendations will be reported on.
13. Working together with the Corporate Performance Team, a pilot application of the model is underway. As of January 2021 all scrutiny recommendations generated by a committee or a task group are being monitored. The Cabinet and service areas have arrangements in place to track and report on the implementation of accepted scrutiny recommendations for presentation to all scrutiny committees 6 monthly.

Way Forward

14. Scrutiny members are advised that a unified approach to capturing and reporting on the impact of scrutiny will be delivered by:
 - Recording, tracking and reporting on the implementation of accepted scrutiny recommendations generated from both committee correspondence and task group inquiries.
 - Producing a single Scrutiny Annual Report for the 2020-21 municipal year, replacing the existing individual scrutiny committee annual reports, agreed by all five scrutiny committees. The report will focus on the outcomes that have been achieved and encourage public participation and engagement with Scrutiny. It is anticipated that the new Scrutiny Annual Report will be presented in draft, for approval, to all Scrutiny Committees at their June meetings, prior to being submitted to Council.

My Ref: T: Scrutiny/PRAP/Comm Papers/Correspondence

Date: 20 January 2021

Councillor Caro Wild,
Cabinet Member, Strategic Planning & Transport,
Cardiff Council,
County Hall,
Cardiff
CF10 4UW



County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088

Dear Cllr Wild,

PRAP: 20 January 2021 - Bus Emergency Scheme Phase 2 (BES 2)

Thank you for attending the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee for consideration of the Bus Emergency Scheme Phase 2 (BES 2) as an urgent item. Would you also please pass Members' thanks to the officers in attendance, Jason Dixon, Operational Manager, and John Gibson Principal Engineer.

The Committee notes that since the start of the pandemic Welsh Government (WG), Transport for Wales (TfW), bus operators and Local Authorities have been working in partnership to ensure that transport is available on key routes. We note also that you consider BES 2 to be a good opportunity to implement improvements in a partnership model of transport planning and therefore are proposing that Cabinet give the Lead Local Authority for the City region on this matter (Monmouthshire County Council) approval to sign the BES 2 agreement on behalf of Cardiff Council. Members reflected on this position and wish to pass on the following observations and concerns to inform Cabinet's consideration of the matter tomorrow.

We understand that the BES 2 emergency funding agreement formalises the WG offer of financial support to bus operators until July 2022, incentivising them to cover all routes rather than commercially profitable routes only. The Committee is concerned at the implications for Cardiff Bus routes if the Council signs up to the BES 2, given that there will be guidance from Welsh Government that could mean changes to existing routes and, potentially, to more profitable ones.

Members consider there is a risk that the conditions attached to the proposal to incentivise operators to engage in planned changes in line with Welsh Government's

longer-term ambitions for reform could be unattractive to some smaller bus operators.

Members are keen to establish the role that TfW will play longer term, and whether they are likely to control all modes of transport in Cardiff including bus services. We acknowledge the benefit of linked ticketing and the opportunity for more circular routes around the City. We note also that the BES 2 intention is that Local Authorities retain all powers to provide supplementary services where there is a gap in provision. We acknowledge the potential benefit of TfW acting in a co-ordinating role, helping Local Authorities to better understand transport planning. However, it may be the case that not all bus operators, who had no choice in the loss making restrictions which were imposed, will accept the constraints, including profit capping, which signing up to BES 2 would entail.

Members feel strongly that the Council's ambitious environmental priorities necessitate that it retains control over the type and quality of its bus fleet. It is imperative that the Council retains autonomy on this matter to ensure it can deliver and support its environmental and cost saving priorities.

Finally, we are keen to establish the Council's progress in recovering the monies loaned to Cardiff Bus during the pandemic and **request** that you pass on our enquiry to the relevant Cabinet Member and Corporate Director for a response.

Once again thank you for your commitment to the scrutiny process.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "David Walker". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

**COUNCILLOR DAVID WALKER
CHAIR, POLICY REVIEW AND PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

cc Members of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee
Cabinet Observers, Leaders of opposition groups
Andrew Gregory, Director of Planning, Transportation & Environment
Jason Dixon, Operational Manager, Transport, Development & Network
Management
John Gibson Principal Engineer, Public Transport
Joanne Watkins, Cabinet Office Manager
Lili Thompson, Cabinet Support Officer
Andrea Redman, Committee Support Officer

This page is intentionally left blank

**SWYDDFA CYMORTH Y CABINET
CABINET SUPPORT OFFICE**

Fy Nghyf / My Ref: CM45098

Dyddiad / Date: 22nd February 2021

Councillor David Walker
Chair, Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee
County Hall
Atlantic Wharf
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Annwyl / Dear Cllr Walker,

Prap: 20 January 2021 - Bus Emergency Scheme Phase 2 (Bes 2)

Thank you for your letter dated 20th January 2021 in relation to the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee held on 20th January 2021. For clarity, I have produced this response in the same order as the questions in your letter:

“The Committee is concerned at the implications for Cardiff Bus routes if the Council signs up to the BES 2, given that there will be guidance from Welsh Government that could mean changes to existing routes and, potentially, to more profitable ones.”

There are no profitable routes at the moment. Yes, it is a risk that has been acknowledged and will be managed collaboratively in good faith through the BES 2 agreement. We cannot safeguard the position of any bus operators but we can work with them, Welsh Government, Transport for Wales and the lead local authority to ensure that the competitions rules are complied with.

“Members consider there is a risk that the conditions attached to the proposal to incentivise operators to engage in planned changes in line with Welsh Government’s longer-term ambitions for reform could be unattractive to some smaller bus operators.”

Yes, there is a risk that operators do not sign up to the BES 2 agreement. Smaller operators would have guaranteed income which could help them with their finances that may not be as resilient as larger operators. Larger operators may have greater flexibility to consider their position because they may be more financially resilient.

“Members are keen to establish the role that TfW will play longer term, and whether they are likely to control all modes of transport in Cardiff including bus services.”

The future role of TfW is not currently known. Opportunities for TfW may present themselves through the establishment of the Corporate Joint Committees. Further opportunities may be available through the additional powers in the public transport legislation that is proposed to be progressed in the next term of the Senedd.

“We acknowledge the benefit of linked ticketing and the opportunity for more circular routes around the City.”

TfW are currently working on integrated ticketing. Circular routes are one of the many considerations for establishing an improved bus network. Consultation will be arranged with local members where there are local changes proposed. Subject to revenue budget constraints, Cardiff Council would need to fund any s63 services where the lead local authority under the BES 2 agreement does not agree with the changes.

“It may be the case that not all bus operators, who had no choice in the loss making restrictions which were imposed, will accept the constraints, including profit capping, which signing up to BES 2 would entail.”

Under the bus hardship fund, BES 1 and BES 1.5 profit was not permitted through the reconciliation process. BES 2 will allow for a capped profit based on Welsh Government criteria that it is understood will take into account the operational requirements of the bus operators and which may also include consideration of upgrades to their fleet.

“Members feel strongly that the Council’s ambitious environmental priorities necessitate that it retains control over the type and quality of its bus fleet.”

The Council has no control over the bus fleet of any of the operators whether it is Cardiff Bus or anyone else because it is a commercial operational consideration. We can work cooperatively with operators to encourage them to upgrade their fleet to be more environmentally sustainable. There are also incentives that the Welsh Government are offering for retrofitting or replacing vehicles. However, the bus operators still need to provide match funding.

“We are keen to establish the Council’s progress in recovering the monies loaned to Cardiff Bus during the pandemic and request that you pass on our enquiry to the relevant Cabinet Member and Corporate Director for a response.”

This matter is outside of the scope of the BES 2 agreement. The Council has as agreed sought to recover this emergency support (provided to avoid a failure event for the company and potentially avoid much greater costs falling back on the Council) through the COVID Recovery Fund but unfortunately this was rejected earlier this year.

That fact has been reported within each of the Monitoring reports presented to Cabinet. The Council has also raised the issue directly with the company and they are aware that the COVID Recovery Fund claim was rejected.

With greater certainty now around bus funding including BES2, we will continue to pursue this with the company, although it cannot be said at this stage that we will recover funding in this financial year - it may need to be a longer term arrangement that we agree with the Company but Members will continue to be updated regularly.

I trust the above is of assistance. If you have any further queries, please do not hesitate to contact either my officers or myself directly.

Yn gywir / Yours sincerely,



Cynghorydd / Councillor Caro Wild
Aelod Cabinet dros Gynllunio Strategol a Thrafnidiaeth
Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport

This page is intentionally left blank

Date: 28 January 2021

Councillor Saeed Ebrahim,
Chair, Race Equality Taskforce,
Cardiff Council,
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW



County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088

Dear Councillor Ebrahim,

PRAP Scrutiny Committee 20 January 2021: Race Equality Taskforce

Further to your progress update to the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee on the work of the Race Equality Taskforce on 20 January 2021, on behalf of the Members thank you for your positive report and presentation. Members wish to express their appreciation to yourself as Chair, to the Leader, Councillor Huw Thomas, and to officers Gareth Newell and Sian Sanders for supporting effective engagement with scrutiny. Following the scrutiny I have been asked to pass on Members' comments and observations as follows.

Taskforce Membership - quality and coverage

The Committee notes that following a public appointments process you are pleased to have appointed 14 members to the Taskforce representing the Council, public, private and voluntary sectors, all bringing leadership within their own field of expertise to the panel. We are pleased to note that the Chair of the Council's BAME staff network is also a member of the Taskforce. However Members consider it particularly important that the Youth Justice Service is represented on the Taskforce to ensure that the experiences of young ethnic minority groups are brought forward. You explained that the membership aims to encompass diverse geographical and ethnic representation. We wish to stress the importance of membership representing all BAME communities.

Taskforce output

We note you have put in place 5 work streams, 3 Council-led and governed (Employment & Representative Workforce; Education & Young People's Experience of Services; and Citizen's Voice) and 2 Partner-led (Health & Social Care; and

Criminal Justice). We understand that the Taskforce will expect regular reports from the 3 Council led work streams commencing in February. The Committee was keen to establish how you will ensure good quality output from the work streams, noting that recommendations from Council-led work streams will be reported directly to Cabinet, and Partner-led work streams to the PSB and Community Safety Partnership respectively.

The Taskforce has been created in the final year of the current Administration, as such we note the Leaders view that the work of the Taskforce can span Administrations where there is the political will. We note that, whilst some quick wins are hoped for within the current Administration, the work of the Taskforce and the recommendations of its work streams will also apply longer term.

A representative workforce

The papers that supported this item indicate that the BAME community make up over 20% of Cardiff's population. We strongly concur with the Leader's view that the Council has an opportunity to show leadership on the matter of a representative workforce and aspire to its own workforce truly representing the City's demographics. Members consider there is currently poor representation from the BAME community at both operational and senior management levels for such a cosmopolitan city as Cardiff. Whilst we agree that this is a challenge that cannot be solved quickly we look forward to the recommendations of the Employment work stream in terms of the systems and support required to remove barriers that may prevent career progression for Cardiff Councils' BAME staff members.

Gender balance

The Committee highlighted the low numbers of women in employment of Pakistani and Bangladeshi ethnicity, particularly compared to men of the same ethnicity and we will continue to monitor this. We urge the Taskforce to examine the reasons for such a disparity through its Employment work stream.

Translating educational success into employment opportunities

Members urge that the work streams for Education and Employment collect data on the educational performance of children from ethnic minority groups and how such performance translates into the workplace. We consider there is important analysis to

undertake as to what additional skills employers are looking for that present barriers to the progress of ethnic minority groups in the workplace. Similarly we urge that you examine the importance of networks that could assist ethnic minority groups to seize opportunities.

We consider there is an opportunity to ensure that the work of the Taskforce connects with other key Council projects to ensure BAME youngsters are engaging positively, particularly with the Corporate Apprentices Scheme and the Cardiff Commitment.

Finally, on behalf of the Committee, I wish you well as you take forward the work of the Taskforce and its work streams in difficult times and look forward to welcoming you to the Committee again in the future as your work gathers pace.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "David Walker". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

COUNCILLOR DAVID WALKER
CHAIR, POLICY REVIEW AND PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

cc Members of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee;
Councillor Huw Thomas, Leader, Cardiff Council;
Gareth Newell, Head of Performance and Partnerships;
Sian Sanders Operational Manager, Cohesion and Community Engagement;
Charlotte Amoss, Policy Officer;
Andrea Redmond, Committees Support Officer.

This page is intentionally left blank

Date: 03 February 2021

Councillor David Walker,
Chair, Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee
Cardiff Council,
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Dear Councillor Walker,

PRAP Scrutiny Committee 20 January 2021: Race Equality Taskforce

Further to your recent correspondence, I write on behalf of the Race Equality Taskforce to extend our thanks to the Committee for your invitation to attend this session and for your positive and constructive feedback on the work of the Race Equality Taskforce to date.

I will be pleased to share the Committee's views with the Taskforce at our next convening and will ensure this feedback is shared with the Taskforce's sub-groups across the confirmed themes as appropriate. I wish to reiterate that we value the continued support and interest of elected members in delivering this important initiative for our city.

I note the recommendations of the Committee, which we will ensure are considered as the Taskforce's programme mobilises in the months ahead. I note that you do not require a full response at this early stage of our work.

I look forward to updating you on the progress of the Race Equality Taskforce in the months ahead.

Yours Sincerely,



Councillor Saeed Ebrahim
Chair, Cardiff Race Equality Taskforce

GWEITHIO DROS GAERDYDD, GWEITHIO DROSOCH CHI

Mae'r Gyngor yn croesawu gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg, Saesneg neu'n ddwyieithog. Byddwn yn cyfathrebu â chi yn ôl eich dewis, dim ond i chi roi gwybod i ni pa un sydd well genynch. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

WORKING FOR CARDIFF, WORKING FOR YOU

The Council welcomes correspondence in Welsh, English or bilingually. We will ensure that we communicate with you in the language of your choice, as long as you let us know which you prefer. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay.



This page is intentionally left blank

Date: 26 January 2021



County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088

Councillor Chris Weaver,
Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation & Performance,
Cardiff Council,
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Dear Chris,

PRAP Scrutiny Committee 20 January 2021: Budget Consultation 20221/22

Thank you for attending Committee on 20 January 2021 to update us on budget modelling and the 2021/22 budget consultation. I would be grateful if you would pass on my appreciation to Chris Lee, Gareth Newell and Sian Sanders for presenting the position and answering Members questions at the remote meeting. I have been asked to pass on Members' comments and observations as follows.

Budget update

Thank you for your overview of provisional settlement headlines as part of this briefing. We note the better than expected 3.8% provisional settlement for Cardiff Council, increases in Social Services, Housing Support, and MEAG grants and that the Council has so far been allocated Covid-19 funding of £77.3m by Welsh Government. We acknowledge you still face a £16.4m budget gap and note that your budget modelling at this point makes no provision for a staff pay award, however you will be making an assumption to avoid pressurising services during the year.

Budget consultation shaping the 2022/23 budget

We note the pared back approach to this year's consultation requesting that respondents simply rank their top 3 and least important from a list of 11 priorities. We note also that Covid-19 restrictions have confined engagement to online only and that timelines are shorter than in previous years.

We note you are currently drafting the Corporate Plan alongside the budget and the budget consultation closes on 10th February 2020. We have budget scrutiny committees programmed to consider both budget proposals and the Corporate Plan

a week and a half later. The Committee is therefore keen to establish that the results of this consultation will shape discussions on the Corporate Plan and the budget. We note that in setting budget priorities you will be merging the results of all consultations undertaken throughout the year and you intend that it informs the Capital programme, the Financial Resilience Model and influences longer term budget planning.

A voice for younger residents

The Committee notes that Ask Cardiff 2020 experienced a fall in the response rate for under 35's. Focussing on a voice for younger residents, Members highlighted the opportunity for children/schools/youth justice to have a clear channel to inform the budget consultation. We were concerned to hear that there is not a child friendly version this year, however the results of the Child Friendly Cardiff survey will be factored into budget discussions. We heard that you will be contacting schools to help you access young people's views. We suggest that you draw out and test ideas from the Child Friendly Survey to inform future priorities. The Committee therefore **recommends** that in future an accessible child friendly version is made available.

Improving response rates

At the time of this scrutiny officers indicated that the response rate to the consultation had been positive at over 1,000 just one week on from its launch. We note also officer's views that you consider tailoring consultation channels to ensure a representative response is more important than the overall total number of responses. As you continue to tailor engagement to all demographics we wish to highlight the need for continual learning and development. The Committee considers it is important to monitor the relative response rates to advertising on different platforms (eg Instagram v Facebook) learning the lessons as to which platforms are most successful at enhancing response rates. We suggest that there is an opportunity for more creative copy text in designing adverts to encourage residents to complete the survey and we **recommend** that you address this in future surveys.

Member engagement & scrutiny of budget consultation

This has been an unusual year, culminating in challenging timescales for administering the budget consultation due to the very late announcement of the provisional settlement. We note you are aware of the challenge ahead to incorporate consultation results into corporate plan priority and budget setting, and that you hope to achieve this. As we have previously requested, though it has not been possible this year, this Committee **recommends** that you improve Member consultation, by routinely factoring pre-publication scrutiny of the budget consultation into your budget planning.

Recommendations to be monitored following this scrutiny:

- That you draw out and test ideas from the Child Friendly Survey to inform future priorities, and in future years an accessible child friendly version of the budget consultation is made available.
- That you examine the opportunity for more creative copy text in designing adverts to encourage residents to complete surveys.
- As previously requested you improve Member consultation, by routinely factoring pre-publication scrutiny of the budget consultation into your budget planning.

Finally, on behalf of the Committee, I wish to thank you and the officers for your continued support for the internal challenge of important issues that can improve the quality of services the Council is delivering to its customers.

Yours sincerely,



COUNCILLOR DAVID WALKER
CHAIR, POLICY REVIEW AND PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

cc Members of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee;
Chris Lee, Corporate Director Resources;
Gareth Newell, Head of Performance and Partnerships; and
Sian Sanders Operational Manager, Cohesion and Community Engagement,
Alison Taylor, Cabinet Support Officer
Joanne Watkins, Cabinet Business Manager;
Andrea Redmond, Committees Support Officer.

Date: 24 February 2021



Councillors Huw Thomas
Leader, and Chris Weaver, Cabinet Member
Finance, Modernisation and Performance,
City of Cardiff Council
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Dear Huw and Chris,

Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee: 24 February 2021.

Thankyou both for joining the remote meeting of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee yesterday to facilitate consideration of the draft Corporate Plan 2021-24 and the draft Budget Proposals 2021-22. As Chair I wish to convey the Committee's gratitude for the co-operation of the Chief Executive, Corporate Directors and senior officers in attendance to answer Members' questions. Members acknowledge that the development of both the Corporate Plan and the Budget has been challenging this year set against the backdrop of the Covid-19 pandemic, however we wish to pass on the following observations and concerns. Firstly, comments on the Corporate Plan; secondly on the Corporate Revenue Budget and Resources Budget Proposals; followed by our comments on the Capital Programme.

Corporate Plan 2021-24

The Committee continues to welcome policy development engagement between Scrutiny and Cabinet in respect of the Corporate Plan, prior to pre-decision scrutiny, recognising the benefit of informal engagement with the Cabinet during its development. Members have asked me to pass on the following observations, which are listed by Well-being Objective:

- **WBO1** – Members were keen to establish how the Plan will address children's learning needs following the pandemic and potential longer term mental health issues. We note the commitment to schools opening safely, a quality approach to blended learning, illustrated by the schools recovery programme

and multi-agency group working to deliver targeted support. We support the commitment to digital device provision to ensure equity of access to learning.

- **WBO1** - Members were advised that data for deprived communities and extra support for learners is now available and there are some challenges to address. The Committee feels it is important that the Council manages support for disadvantaged older pupils and those known to the Youth Justice Service. This is a vulnerable cohort of young people and the Council can play a major part in linking the cohort with employment support. We note there are financial adjustments in the budget to support mentoring and the intention to link with the Cardiff Commitment. We note the aspiration in S1.22 to implement the action plans arising from the Social Care Commissioning Strategy by December 2022.
- **WBO1** – The Committee considers support for parents is also important. Our concern is that there should be at least one device to support home learning available in every household and we urge you to seize the opportunity of improving the support for blended learning. Looking ahead we endorse that the 20,000 devices distributed should be retained by schools for temporary ownership by the child whilst remaining part of the Cardiff education service.
- **WBO2** - We feel the target for Dementia Friends officer training (KPI2.9) is achievable, however we urge all political parties to support such training.
- **WBO3** – Members note that the Plan aims to narrow the inequality gap across Cardiff and wish to suggest that there is logic in developing a Southern Arc Strategy that links education and employment opportunities. We acknowledge the improvement already delivered via the Education 2030 strategy however feel there is a step change required which takes such schools from ‘improving’ to ‘excellent’. There are London school models the Council can learn from which demonstrate the very high outcomes which can be expected from students from deprived areas and the impact of excellent education on employment prospects. We recommend that research is carried out this year to compare achievements and methods of schools in deprived areas of Cardiff with those highlighted as excellent in comparable London boroughs.
- **WBO5** - The Committee is concerned that on the matter of regeneration, whilst the Plan sets out a clear objective and steps to lead a recovery programme for the City Centre and Bay, there is also an opportunity to focus more support on local district centres. We feel that not all office workers are

likely to return to City Centre work places and, rather than cling to a past model, the Council needs to accommodate changing work and work place patterns. Members consider the Plan would benefit from a rewritten emphasis on supporting local communities and recommend that this be included.

- **WBO7** - The Committee highlighted that over the past year a body of data has built up in respect of non IT-literate households that must be captured to inform service development. We note the proposal to develop a new citizen engagement strategy by December 2021, and the development of a new App, and we look forward to you sharing this with the Committee for policy development scrutiny in the summer.
- **WBO7** – Members note the Corporate Plan step to *develop a comprehensive programme of organisational recovery and renewal (S7.1)* and the Chief Executive’s commitment to urgently progress this work, including a fundamental review of agile working and other efficiency opportunities with proposals due in May 2021. We look forward to seeing references to potential productivity improvements in the Plan and to policy development scrutiny as the organisation implements change.
- On a more general note, whilst we consider that the Corporate Plan and the budget are integrated, we consider that the absence of any financial, staff productivity or value for money targets represents a gap in the Corporate Plan.

Corporate overview of Budget Proposals 2021-22

- We note that the budget contains an estimate for a 2% staff pay increase in 2021/22, but that the outcome will not be known until much later in the year with teaching salaries being in a separate and potentially different group.
- Members were pleased to hear that the Council has continued to budget for payment of the 20% salary bill to all furloughed staff. We note your success in securing Welsh Government Covid-19 grant monies given the rigorous process for demonstrating the losses due to the pandemic.
- Continuing on the issue of staff we note that secondments to the TTP service will continue beyond the vaccine programme roll out.
- The Committee heard your statement that the proposed Council Tax rise is one of the lowest when compared with some other Welsh Authorities but note that with inflation at 0.9% it is likely be set at over three times that level. You

also stated that, as yet, there is no indication that council tax collection rates will be dramatically lower for 2020/21.

- The Committee observed that the Council is proposing to maintain a £3m contingency fund and to make use of Council reserves. We note that the section 151 officer is comfortable with the level of earmarked and general reserves relative to the size of the Council's budget.
- Members noted the month 9 improvement in the overspend in respect of Adult and Children's services, despite ongoing pressures in both areas. This continues to be a high risk area for budget overspend and needs to be closely monitored this financial year.
- This Committee endorses your ambition in seeking Directorate savings for the 2021/22 budget. We concur that it is appropriate to apply differential savings requirements depending on the challenges faced and the level of efficiency assessed, rather than apply an across -the -board request for savings which would treat all departments as performing equally.
- Members noted significant falls in income generation this year given the pandemic. You clearly understand that those service areas which rely on income will suffer additional pressures in the forthcoming year and may require further central government and Council support. We note also that in setting the budget you have placed less reliance on income from public attractions and more on services unaffected by the external environment, such as commercial waste services.
- In respect of homelessness, we note that Welsh Government funding is secure for 2022/23. However the Committee is keen to support affordable capital investment to ensure the Council is prepared for future years and is able to consolidate the success achieved in tackling this issue during the pandemic.
- The Committee urges you to continue efforts to show separately the Covid-19 costs in future budget monitoring reports. We acknowledge the table as set out in the month 9 report is a starting point and whilst it is challenging to look ahead it should be easier in 2021/22 as all savings proposed have been set within the context of Covid-19.

Resources Budget Proposals 2021-22

- The Committee notes that officers consider a review of staffing resources in Accountancy (line 82) is achievable. As the Council transitions to new project work areas it will be key to ensure the right skills mix in the team and we note the intention to develop the Council's own CIPFA trainees.

Capital Programme 2021-22

- The Committee considers that the Capital Programme contains a wide range of projects, and we note that, at £1.3billion, it represents a larger 5 year programme than previous years.
- Comparing the levels of expenditure proposed for each of the next 5 years, we note substantial differences. You explained the difference is directly related to the level of certainty of Welsh Government grants. Whilst the Council is advised of grants 1-2 years ahead, it is rarely given notice 4-5 years ahead.
- Members requested more information on line 68 of the Capital Programme, Roath Park Dam. We are seeking clarification as to whether the work proposed is aligned to the Natural Resources Wales flood relief work.
- The Committee recommends that you consider using a RAG rating to indicate the risk level for each Capital Programme project. The risk level allocated would be based on the financial risk to the Council and the achievability of the project. We note that the Treasury Management Strategy requires the Council to have constant oversight of the Capital Programme, given that Council borrowing covers the whole Capital Programme and not individual projects.

Requests following this scrutiny:

- The Committee urges you to refine the presentation of Covid-19 costs in future budget monitoring reports to make clear where savings are not achieved due to the impact of Covid-19.
- Additional information on line 68 of the Capital Programme, Roath Park Dam, providing clarification that the work proposed is aligned to the Natural Resources Wales flood relief work.

Recommendations to be monitored following this scrutiny:

- Consider a RAG rating to indicate the risk level for each Capital Programme project

- Strengthen the Corporate Plan to focus more on local district centres and supporting local communities. Specifically strengthen the link between the allocation of £2m of Capital budget for regeneration over 4 years and the Corporate Plan priorities within WBO5.
- Consider developing a Southern Arc Strategy that links education and employment opportunities to narrow the inequality gap across Cardiff.
- That all Members who have not yet undertaken Dementia Friends training are encouraged to do so.

On behalf of the Committee and the Scrutiny service as a whole, I wish to acknowledge your commitment to engaging with the five Scrutiny Committees, both in respect of the Corporate Plan 2021-24 and of the Budget Proposals 2021-22. I look forward to an ongoing positive working relationship between Cabinet and Scrutiny for the benefit of Cardiff citizens.

Yours sincerely,



COUNCILLOR DAVID WALKER

CHAIR, POLICY REVIEW AND PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

cc Members of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee
 Paul Orders, Chief Executive
 Chris Lee, Corporate Director Resources
 Sarah McGill, Corporate Director, People & Communities
 Ian Allwood, Head of Finance
 Anil Hirani, OM Capital, Corporate & Treasury
 Gareth Newell, Partnership and Community Engagement Manager
 Dylan Owen, Head of Cabinet Office
 Gary Jones, Head of Democratic Services
 Joanne Watkins, Cabinet Support Office
 Debi Said, PA to Leader

Cyf/My Ref: CM45296
Eich Cyf/Your Ref: Scrutiny/PRAP/Comm Papers/Correspondence
Dyddiad/Date: 24 February 2021

Cllr David Walker
Chairperson, Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee
City of Cardiff Council
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Dear David

Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee: 24 February 2021 Draft Budget Proposals 2021/22

Thank you for your letter dated 24 February 2021 and the useful comments raised. I can assure you that Cabinet was able to reflect on the points raised prior to our meeting on 25 February 2021.

I would like to take the opportunity to thank the Committee for their work in supporting the development of the Corporate Plan, the members who participated in the Performance Panel and Councillor Walker for once again chairing Performance Panel session. I believe that this has strengthened policy development and performance monitoring in the Council and further enhanced the role of scrutiny. A full response to the observations and recommendations made by the Performance Panel has been included as an appendix to this letter (Appendix A). I am pleased to note that a number of the proposals made by the Performance Panel, and this Committee, have been included in the Corporate Plan, alongside the recommendations of the other Scrutiny Committees.

The discussion on the safe restart of Schools, regaining lost ground and wider learner wellbeing was welcome, and note the recommendation that research is carried out to compare achievements and methods of schools in deprived areas of Cardiff with those highlighted as excellent in comparable London boroughs. The Council is currently working towards the Curriculum for Wales 2022, in accordance with The Curriculum and Assessment (Wales) Bill 2020. The Curriculum for Wales framework gives every school in Wales the opportunity to design their own curriculum within a national approach that ensures a level of consistency. It will provide scope within a national framework for

GWEITHIO DROS GAERDYDD, GWEITHIO DROSOCH CHI

Mae'r Cyngor yn croesawu gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg, Saesneg neu'n ddwyieithog. Byddwn yn cyfathrebu â chi yn ôl eich dewis, dim ond i chi roi gwybod i ni pa un sydd well gennych. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

WORKING FOR CARDIFF, WORKING FOR YOU

The Council welcomes correspondence in Welsh, English or bilingually. We will ensure that we communicate with you in the language of your choice, as long as you let us know which you prefer. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay.



schools to shape a curriculum, which connects, meaningfully to the local community and the experiences of learners. It would therefore not be appropriate to be comparing 'methods of schools' with London Boroughs. Further to this, the Welsh Government are currently consulting on New School Improvement Guidance: a Framework for Evaluation, Improvement and Accountability, which propose reforming current arrangements to ensure that accountability systems are aligned with the new Curriculum. As you're aware this has resulted in the removal of all shared pupil attainment data, categorisation and at the moment Estyn inspections too. It would therefore be inappropriate at this time to consider how school performance would be compared to Schools outside of Wales. The focus must remain on embedding the new arrangements for Wales.

I agree with the Committee that, following the pandemic, it is likely that working and travel patterns will be modified. As part of the recovery work the Council will take forward, a programme of measures to support district centres, as well as the City Centre and Bay. Committee members considered that the Plan would benefit from a rewritten emphasis on supporting local communities, and I would therefore draw attention to Step 6.21 *"Create better places through the delivery of new, high-quality, well-designed, sustainable and well-connected communities, as described by the Council's Master Planning Principle, by Applying place-making principles to major new settlements and developments, as well as existing communities, to support local centres and support the '15-minute city' principle and Utilising Section 106 contributions to help facilitate these improvements."*

I particularly welcome the Committee's support for the programme of work to establish Cardiff as a Dementia Friendly City. As all members of this administration have attended the Dementia Friendly training, I can strongly recommend attending and, in response to the Committee's specific request, I have agreed with Democratic Services that Dementia Friendly Training will be added to the Member's Development Programme for the year ahead.

As outlined at meeting of the Committee, the Council will progress a comprehensive programme of organisational recovery and renewal to capture the innovation and productivity gains achieved during lockdown. This work will include a full consideration of key metrics such financial, staff productivity and value for money measures.

In respect to the specific comments in your letter in respect to the Budget and Capital, I provide the following;

- I can confirm that the work on the Roath Park Dam is as a result of an instruction from Natural Resources Wales and is aligned with the flood relief work. The proposed works to the Dam at Roath Park will be scoped in consultation with Natural Resources Wales and ensure that opportunities for mitigating the impacts of the final phase of the Roath Brook Flood Scheme are secured.
- I can confirm that Officers will continue to refine the presentation of Covid-19 costs in future budget monitoring reports and will consider how RAG ratings for the Capital Programme can be best incorporated into future reports and will report to a future Scrutiny Committee meeting.

I hope that this letter captures all the points raised in your letter and thank you again for your support in the budget process this year.

Yn gywir
Yours sincerely



Y Cyng | Cllr Huw Thomas
Arweinydd Cyngor Caerdydd | Leader, Cardiff Council



Y Cyngorydd/Councillor Christopher Weaver
Aelod Cabinet dros Gyllid, Moderneiddio a Pherfformiad/Cabinet member for
Finance, Modernisation & Performance

cc Members of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee
Paul Orders, Chief Executive
Chris Lee, Corporate Director Resources
Sarah McGill, Corporate Director, People & Communities
Ian Allwood, Head of Finance
Anil Hirani, OM Capital, Corporate & Treasury
Gareth Newell, Partnership and Community Engagement Manager
Dylan Owen, Head of Cabinet Office
Gary Jones, Head of Democratic Services
Joanne Watkins, Cabinet Support Office
Debi Said, PA to Leader

This page is intentionally left blank

Policy Performance and Review Scrutiny Committee – Forward Work Programme May – July 2021

Subject to review due to the ongoing Coronavirus pandemic.

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg.

18 May 2021

Capital Ambition: Organisational Recovery and Renewal

To scrutinise the Cabinet report outlining how the Council will seek to adapt to the challenges and opportunities of the new operating environment as the city emerges from the current phase of the pandemic.

Invitees:

Leader
Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation and Performance
Chief Executive
Corporate Director, Resources
Corporate Director, People & Communities
Head of Performance and Partnerships

9 June 2021

Corporate Property Strategy 2021 to 2026

To carry out pre-decision scrutiny of an updated Corporate Property Strategy for the next 5 years.

Invitees:

Cabinet Member Investment & Development;
Director of Economic Development;
Assistant Director, Corporate Landlord
Head of Property

Homeworking Policy

To scrutinise a revised homeworking policy to support the increase in homeworking following the Covid-19 pandemic.

Invitees:

Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation and Performance;
Chief Executive
Chief Officer, Human Resources

Welsh Language Standards -TBC

To consider the Welsh Language Annual Report 2020-21. Cardiff Council is under a duty to comply with standards relating to producing and publishing an Annual Report.

Invitees

Leader

Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance

Corporate Director, Resources

Operational Manager Bi-lingual Cardiff

Scrutiny Annual Report 2020/21

To consider the joint Scrutiny Annual Report for 2020/21, prior to its consideration by Council on the 24th June 2021

Invitees

None

14 July 2021

Budget Strategy 2022/23

To consider the Budget Strategy for 2021/22 and the Council's financial resilience planning.

Invitees

Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation and Performance

Corporate Director, Resources

Head of Finance

Wellbeing Report 2020/21

To monitor the Council's statutory end of year performance.

Invitees

Leader

Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation and Performance

Chief Executive

Corporate Director, Resources

Corporate Director, People & Communities

Head of Performance and Partnerships

Sickness Absence -TBC

To monitor the Council's progress in tackling sickness absence, updating the Committee on the 2020/21 outturn sickness absence figures.

Invitees

Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation and Performance
Chief Executive
Corporate Director, Resources
Chief Human Resources Officer
HR People Partner

Task and Finish Inquiry - ongoing

Homeworking

To examine how the experience of working remotely during the pandemic can inform future policy on autonomy at work, operating within a culture of care and trust.

Invitees:

Various

DRAFT

This page is intentionally left blank